



NE290D: Rare Neutral Particle Detection in Fundamental and Applied Physics:

Reactor antineutrino Spectra & Neutrino Safeguards

Thierry Lasserre (CEA, <u>thierry.lasserre@cea.fr</u>) Sept. 30th & Oct. 2nd 2014, University of California, Berkeley





NE290D Lecture #10 : Reactor antineutrinos spectra

NE290D Lecture #11: Neutrino Safeguards





NE290D Lecture #10

- Nuclear Reactors
- Reactor Antineutrino Flux
- Fuel Burn-up & Neutrino Flux
- Reactor Antineutrino Energy Spectra
 - Ab-Initio Computation using Nuclear Databases
 - Computation using Experimental Integral β-Data





NE290D Lecture #10

- Nuclear Reactors

- Reactor Antineutrino Flux
- Fuel Burn-up & Neutrino Flux
- Reactor Antineutrino Energy Spectra
 - Ab-Initio Computation using Nuclear Databases
 - Computation using Experimental Integral β-Data



Nuclear Reactors



Power Nuclear Stations:

- 201 in the world (most of them having multiple units)
- Total thermal power = 1134 GWth total thermal power
- Mixed fuel (^{235,238}U & ^{239,241}Pu)
- Thermal neutron flux (0.025 eV)
- Extended neutrino source:
 - 3-4m diameter, 4m high

Non-Power Nuclear Reactors:

- Research reactors used as neutron source
- Reactors used for propulsion
- Highly enriched in ²³⁵U
- Thermal neutron flux
- Extended/Compact neutrino source (0.6mx0.6m possible)

Reactor Types

- Pressurized Light Water Reactor (PWR)
- Boiling Water Reactor (BWR)
- CANDU (heavy water)
- Naval
- Research
- Weapons Production
- New Technology





Nuclear Fuel



Uranium based fuel

- Mainly ²³⁸U (99.2745%, T_{1/2}=4.47 10⁹ y)
- Naturally: 0.7% of ²³⁵U (fissile, T_{1/2}=703.8 10⁶ y)
- \rightarrow fuel in form of UO₂

<mark>■</mark> 238U

- High neutron capture threshold (0.8 MeV)
- No fission with thermal neutrons
- Fissions induced by fast neutrons

Enrichment in ²³⁵U (3.5% in PWR)

 Fission chain reactions induced by thermal neutrons on ²³⁵U

But other reactions:

- ²³⁸U capture neutrons
- → in-situ production of ²³⁹Pu, ²⁴¹Pu
- \rightarrow Proliferate









Fission of ²³⁵U

$U(235,92) + n_{th} \rightarrow X(A1,Z1) + Y(A2,Z2) + 2 n_{fast}$

- X, Y are called 'Fission Fragments' or 'Fission Products'
- Highest fission yields for the couple: Zr(94,40) and Ce(140,58)
 - X+Y: 40+58=98 protons & 94+140=234 neutrons
 - On average 6 neutrons have to β -decay to 6 protons to reach stability \rightarrow 6 v
 - On average 1.5 v (25%) are emitted with $E_V > 1.8 \text{ MeV}$



Two ''Mass' Bumps: Z=86-104, Z=130-148



Energy Released per Fission



- Illustrative example:
- $^{238}_{92}U \rightarrow ^{119}_{46}Cs + ^{119}_{46}Cs$
 - U(92,238) : B(Z,A)/A=7.6 MeV/nucleon
 - Cs(46,119): B(Z,A)/A=8.5 MeV/nucleon
 - Energy released = $\Delta m.c^2$ = 238x8.5 MeV 2x119x7.6 MeV \approx 215 MeV





U/Pu Fission Cross Sections



 ${}^{235}\text{U} + n_{\text{th}} \rightarrow X + Y + 2 n_{\text{fast}}$ ${}^{239}\text{Pu} + n_{\text{th}} \rightarrow X + Y + 2 n_{\text{fast}}$ ${}^{238}\text{U} + n_{\text{fast}} \rightarrow X + Y + 2 n_{\text{fast}}$



Nuclear Chain Reaction & Neutrinos

- Nuclear reactors are copious, isotropic sources of electron antineutrinos
- Neutrinos come from β-fission fragments, not directly from the fission
- Fission of ²³⁵U, ²³⁸U, ²³⁹Pu, ²⁴¹Pu

cea

- β-decay of neutron rich fission fragments
 - $X(A,Z) \rightarrow Y(A,Z+1) + e^+ anti-v_e + Q$
 - Q ≈ 200 MeV / fission released
 - Fission rate ≈ 4 GW/200 MeV ~ 2.10²⁰ /s
 - 6 anti-v_eemitted per fission
 - 7.5 10²⁰ anti-v_e/s for a 4 GW nuclear core
- Antineutrino spectrum is time dependent as the beta daughters come into equilibrium









NE290D Lecture #10

- Nuclear Reactors

- Reactor Antineutrino Flux
- Fuel Burn-up & Neutrino Flux
- Reactor Antineutrino Energy Spectra
 - Ab-Initio Computation using Nuclear Databases
 - Computation using Experimental Integral β-Data





10²⁰ fissions in a 4 GW nuclear core (estimate) 200 MeV/fission et 6 v/fission of U²³⁵, Pu^{239,241}

• 200 MeV released per fission:

→ 200 MeV = 200 * 10⁶ * 1,6 10⁻¹⁹ J = **3,2 10⁻¹¹ Joules**

• Thermal Power:

→ 4 GW = 4 10⁹ W (J / s)

• Electron anti-neutrinos

 \rightarrow 4.10⁹ W / 3,2 10⁻¹¹ fissions/sec * 6 neutrinos/fission

 \rightarrow $(\phi_v)^R$ = 7.5 10²⁰ neutrinos / s



Typical Reactor Running Cycle



- Example: Double Chooz experiment
- 3-6 week shutdown every 12-18 months
- 1/4-1/3 of fuel assemblies are replaced, remaining fuel repositioned



6 months shutdown every 10 years



Production of Plutonium in reactors



•
$$^{238}U + n_{fast} \rightarrow ^{239}U + \gamma$$

 $\rightarrow ^{239}Np + e^{-} + \overline{\nu}_{e} \quad (23.45 \text{ m})$
 $\rightarrow ^{239}Pu + e^{-} + \overline{\nu}_{e} \quad (2.36 \text{ d})$

- ²³⁹Pu + n \rightarrow ²⁴⁰Pu + γ
- 240 Pu + n \rightarrow 241 Pu + γ
- Plutonium 239, 240, and 241 are being produced as U is burnt
- ²³⁸U and ²⁴⁰Pu have small cross sections for *fast* neutron induced fission
- ²³⁹Pu, ²⁴¹Pu are fissile isotopes (thermal neutrons)
 - Beta decays \rightarrow electron antineutrino emission



Nuclear Reactor Physics: Basics



- Fission rate of isotope k: $f_k(t) = \Phi_n(t) \sigma_k(t) N_k(t)$ in fissions/s
 - k : ²³⁵Pu, ²³⁸U, ²³⁹Pu, ²⁴¹Pu
 - $\Phi_n(t)$: neutron flux (cm²/s)
 - $\sigma_k(t)$: energy averaged fission cross section (cm²)
 - N_k(t): Number of isotope k (from the mass of isotope k)
 - t is the time running during the fuel cycle
- The evolution of the core isotopic content is ruled by the Bateman equations
- Fission fraction:

$$F_k = \frac{f_k}{\sum_k f_k}$$
, with $\sum_k F_k = 1$

- Burn-up:
 - Measure the number of fissions that occur per unit of mass
 - Equivalent to the amount of energy extracted from a nuclear core
 - Unit: Joules/ton or more commonly MWd/t

Fuel Evolution in a PWR (burn-up)



Fuel evolve with time

Cea

- A typical cycle last 500 days then 1/3 of the fuel is being replaced
- Average fission fractions
 - <F(²³⁸U)>: 53.8%
 - F(²³⁹Pu)> : 32.8%
 - <F(²³⁸U)>: 7.8%
 - <F(²⁴¹Pu)> : 5.6%
 - Others <0.1%</p>
- 250 kg of plutonium produced during a fuel cycle, mainly ²³⁹Pu
- Evolution of the antineutrino flux
 - N (s⁻¹)= a . (1+k) P (GW)
 - k: burn-up factor (Pu/U fraction)
 - k: <10% correction</p>

Information from the operator or You reactor core simulation







NE290D Lecture #10

- Nuclear Reactors
- Reactor Antineutrino Flux
- Fuel Burn-up & Neutrino Flux
- Reactor Antineutrino Energy Spectra
 - Ab-Initio Computation using Nuclear Databases
 - Computation using Experimental Integral β-Data



Reactor Neutrino Yields



- Thermal power, P_{th} in Watt
 - $P_{th}(t) = \sum f_k p_k$
 - f_k : fission rate for the fission isotope k (mainly ^{235,238}U, ^{239,241}Pu)
 - p_k: thermal energy released in one fission of the isotope k
- Total neutrino flux from a reactor
 - $\Phi(E,t) = \Sigma f_k(t) S_k(E)$
 - $S_k(E,t)$: neutrino yield for the fission isotope k
- Energy dependent neutrino yield S_k(E)
 - $S_k(E,t) = \Sigma Y_1^k(t) v_i(E)$
 - $Y_i^k(t)$: cumulative yield for each fission fragment i of fission isotope k
 - v_i(E) : neutrino spectra for a given fission fragment i
 - I runs over ≈800 isotopes
- Neutrino spectrum v_i(E)
 - Never directly measured, even for a given fission fragment i
 - Has to be inferred from the corresponding β-spectrum (e⁻)
 - Challenging since β-decay is a complicated process...











β-decay: Classification



Classification	L	S	∆J= L+S	Δπ	Log ft
Allowed	0	0,1	0, 1 (0⁺→0⁺)	No	4-6
1 st forbid. non-unique	1	0,1	0, 1	Yes	6-10
1 st forbid. unique	1	1	2	Yes	7-10
2 nd forbid. non-unique	2	0,1	2	No	11-14
2 nd forbid. unique	2	1	3	No	14
3 rd forbid. non-unique	3	0,1	3	Yes	17-19
3 rd forbid. unique	3	1	4	Yes	18

- Forbidden decays are less probable because they contain an orbital angular momentum change (higher log ft)

β-decay: Fermi theory & Corrections





Neutrino branch obtained by replacing: $W_v \rightarrow W_0 - W_\beta, G_\beta \rightarrow G_v$

β-decay: shape factor (C_{shape})

Cea





T. Lasserre – UC Berkeley – NE290D

^{Ce2} β-decay: Tritium academic example





Phase space factor

$$\frac{d\Gamma}{dE_e}(m_{v_i}) = C \cdot p_e E_e \cdot \sqrt{\left(E_e - E_0\right)^2 - m_{v_i}^2} \cdot \left(E_e - E_0\right)$$

Coulomb field of the daughter He nucleus

2nd order corrections to Fermi theory

$$\left(\frac{d\Gamma}{dE_e}\right)^{corr} = \frac{d\Gamma}{dE_e} \cdot \left[\prod_{\Psi=L_0, S, E, Q, R, G} \Psi(E_e, Z)\right]$$

- Screening Correction (S)
- He recoil corrections (R)
- Recoiling Coulomb field (Q)
- Finite extension of the nucleus
- Radiative corrections (G)

Radiative Correction

Recoil of the daugther nucleus (+ Weak Magnetism)

Recoiling Coulomb field of ³He

n

n

р

Screening of the orbital electron

Finite Extension of the nucleus

Reactor Neutrino Flux/Spectra

Antineutrino flux

- >99.9% antineutrinos produced by ²³⁵U, ²³⁹Pu, ²³⁸U, ²⁴¹Pu
- >90% antineutrinos produced by ²³⁵U, ²³⁹Pu
- ²³⁵U, ²³⁹Pu, ²⁴¹Pu, and ²³⁸U
 - Case A: ab-inito method 15% uncertainties
 - computation based on nuclear databases
 - old computation (Vogel et al., 1980's)
 - new computation (Mueller/Huber, 2011, +10% w.r. old)

Case B: Conversion method – 3% uncertainties

- electron spectrum measurement
- electron \rightarrow neutrino spectrum conversion
 - old conversion (Schreckenbach et al., 1980's)
 - new conversion (Mueller/Huber et al., 2011, +3.5%, w/r old)

NE290D Lecture #10

- Nuclear Reactors
- Reactor Antineutrino Flux
- Fuel Burn-up & Neutrino Flux
- Reactor Antineutrino Energy Spectra
 - Ab-Initio Computation using Nuclear Databases
 - Computation using Experimental Integral β-Data

Nuclear Fuel Assemblies

- Fuel in N4-type reactors (Chooz, France)
 - 120 tons of UO₂
 - ²³⁵U ≈ 3.45% : 3.60 tons
- 205 fuel assemblies
 - 264 rods per assembly
 - 272 pellets per rods
 - 8 g per pellets
- Loading/unloading
 - by one/third
 - every 1.5 years
- Typical energy extracted
 - 45 GW.d/ton = 3.89 10¹⁵ J/ton
 - Called 'burn-up'

A) Reactor Core Evolution Simulation

A) Reactor Neutrino Flux/Spectra

Reactor neutrino spectrum: notations

Stot(E): integrated neutrino spectrum

$$S_{\text{tot}}(E) = \sum_{k=^{235}\text{U},^{238}\text{U},^{239}\text{Pu},^{241}\text{Pu}} lpha_k imes S_k(E)$$

- S_k(E): neutrino yield normalized to 1 fission of the isotope k
 - E: electron energy
 - α_k : number of fission of the isotope k, at a given time
- Each isotope k undergo fission producing fission products 'fp'
 - A_{fp}(t): activity of the fpth fission product normalized to 1 fission of isotope 'k'

Each fission product decays, via N_b branches connecting the ground state of the parent nucleus to the exited states of the daughter nucleus

- BR_{fb}^p: branching ratio of the bth branch of the fpth fission product
- E_{0fp}^p : end-point energy of the bth branch of the fpth fission product.
- Z_f: charge of the parent nucleus.
- A_f: atomic number of the parent nucleus.

S_k(E): neutrino yield for isotope k

C27

A) ab-inito reactor neutrino spectra

A) Ab-Initio Approach: Results

- **MURE:** Reactor core evolution
- BESTIOLE: β -v conversion code: database of ~800 nuclei and 10000 β -branches

²³⁸U spectrum prediction (not a fit to data)

- Total error in the 10-20% range.
- Dominated by systematics of nuclear databases & missing informations

ILL β-spectrum data (e⁻)

A measurement of the cumulated beta spectrum from ²³⁵U ^{239,241}Pu fission products was performed with a magnetic spectrometer at the ILL reactor (France) in the 1980's

Emitted β spectra per fission of each isotope k

A) Ab-Initio Approach: Uncertainty

Comparison of the ILL β spectra (electron data) with the ab-initio computation

Built ab initio

- 90% of the total β spectra of ²³⁵U and ^{239,241}Pu are described by the sum of measured β -decays x fission yields.

Fitted:

- 10% missing information has to be inferred (fit by 5 virtual βbranches)
Main uncertainty

NE290D Lecture #10

- Nuclear Reactors
- Reactor Antineutrino Flux
- Fuel Burn-up & Neutrino Flux
- Reactor Antineutrino Energy Spectra
 - Ab-Initio Computation using Nuclear Databases
 - Computation using Experimental Integral β-Data

B) Conversion method (1)

• The total β -spectrum, N_{β} , is a sum of all decay branches

$$N_{\beta}(W) = \int N_{\beta}(W, W_0; Z_{eff}) \eta(W_0) dW_0$$

- W : electron energy, in unit of m_e
- W₀ : end-point energy
- Z_{eff} : effective nuclear charge
- $\eta_0(W)$: underlying (weighter) distribution of all end-points

The ILL spectrum can be fitted with N_{vb} effective virtual branches

• Use ILL electron data - Fitting Procedure

- 1 fit an allowed β -spectrum the last s data points with free normalization η and endpoint energy W_0
- 2 delete the last s data points
- 3 subtract the fitted spectrum from the data
- 4 goto 1

27

Invert each virtual branch using energy conservation into a neutrino spectrum and add them all

B) Conversion method (2)

• Fit ILL electron spectrum with a sum of N_{vb}=30 effective branches

- 27

Conversion of the effective branches to v spectra (next slide)

■ a Z_{eff} associated to each virtual branch: mean fit on nuclear data Z=f(W₀) Z(W₀) ≈ 49.5 - 0.7E₀ - 0.09E₀², Z ≥ 34

From e⁻ to v: a single branch

cea

For a single branch energy conservation implies a <u>one-to-one</u> correspondence between β and v spectrum

From e⁻ to v: multiple branches

For multiple branches the conversion has to be applied separately for each branch

But not all the branches properties are well known...

From e⁻ to v: 20 branches

Cea

Apply corrections to Fermi theory

Applied to each virtual branch

Example for a single branch with Z=46, A=117, E_0 =10 MeV

→ Corrections up to 10% - apply to both neutrino/beta spectra

Off-equilibrium effects

- ILL electron reference spectra : 12 to 40 hours irradiation time
- Neutrino reactor experiments irradiation time >> months
- BUT 10% of fission products have a β-decay life-time long enough to keep accumulating after several days
- \rightarrow need a correction through reactor core evolution simulation
- Relative change of v spectrum w.r.t. infinite irradiation time
- 1% correction at E<3 MeV</p>
- Can be computed accurately

B) Reactor Neutrino Spectra

• Useful parameterization:

$$S_{k,\text{fit}}(E_{\nu}) = \exp\left(\sum_{p=1}^{6} \alpha_{pk} E_{\nu}^{p-1}\right)$$

- α parameters can be found in
 - T. Mueller et al., Phys. Rev. C83,054615 (2011)
 - P. Huber, Phys. Rev. C84, 024617(2011)

Cea The Reactor Anomaly: still a mystery

Comparison of A & B

A) Ab initio calculation

Complete simulation of nuclear reactor core evolution

 Fuel loading, geometry, n-capture and fission physics
 → Fission product inventory

Description of all β-decays

- Nuclear databases
- Fermi theory + corrections
 - Nuclear models
- \rightarrow β and v total spectra from some 10⁴ β-branches
 - → 10-20% uncertainty

B) Conversion of total β spectra

- Total β spectra of fissile isotopes measured at ILL in the 80's
- \rightarrow Accurate reference electron spectra

Conversion to antineutrinos

- Use of "virtual" β -branches
- Fermi theory + corrections
- Control of approximations
- → Reference v spectra per isotope to be combined with prediction of fissions rates

→ ≈3% uncertainty

Summary: reactor v spectrum

The prediction of reactor \mathbf{v} spectrum is the dominant source of systematic error for single detector reactor neutrino experiments

Absolute Neutrino Spectrum measurement

Neutrino Spectrum shape & burnup

The energy dependent neutrino yields vary with the burn-up

BACKUP SLIDES

Spent-fuel repository

- Fuel stored for a few years on power plant site in cooling pools
- Potential emitter of antineutrinos
- Main isotopes with Q>1.8 MeV: ¹⁴⁰Ba, ¹⁴⁴Ce, ¹⁰⁶Ru, ⁹⁰Sr
- Typically add $(\phi_v)^{sf} < 0.5\%$ $(\phi_v)^{R}$ due to long half life and low Q

		$M_{\mathcal{M}}/\sigma$					
Isotope	T _{1/2}	²³⁵ U	²³⁹ Pu	Mass (kg)	ß EndPoint	$\frac{M \times \langle O \rangle}{T_{1/2}}$	
¹³¹ I	8.02 d	2.88 10-2	3.84 10-2		0.971		
140 Ba/ 140 La	12.752 d	6.12 10 ⁻²	5.59 10 ⁻²	6.15	3.762		
¹⁴¹ Ce	32.501 d				0.581		
⁸⁹ Sr	50.53 d				1.495		
⁹⁵ Zr/ ⁹⁵ Nb	64.02 d				1.16		
144 Ce/ 144 Pr	284.893 d	5.26 10 ⁻²	3.73 10 ⁻²	5.44	2.997		
106 Ru/ 106 Rh	373.59 d	$4.02 \ 10^{-3}$	$4.28 \ 10^{-2}$	3.06	3.678		
147 Pm/ 147 Sm	2.6234 y	$2.09\ 10^{-2}$	$2.04\ 10^{-2}$		0.224		
⁹⁰ Sr/ ⁹⁰ Y	28.79 y	5.90 10 ⁻²	$2.10\ 10^{-2}$	3.81	2.280		
137 Cs	30.07 y	$6.27 \ 10^{-2}$	6.55 10 ⁻³		1.176		
⁹⁹ Tc	0.21 10 ⁶ y						
93 Zr	$1.5 \ 10^6 \mathrm{y}$		Maaaaa ara	airran far tha t		iu nao	
135Cs	2.0 106 y	after a combustion at 45 GW d / ton					
¹²⁹ I	16. 10 ⁶ y						